

RECEIVED
CENTRAL FAX CENTER

SEP 24 2007

3

Serial No.: 10/550,904
Examiner: Hylton, Robin Annette

REMARKS

In paragraph 1 of the Office Action, the Examiner objected to Claim 8 citing the phrase "for coupling to a corresponding coupling thread of said container mouth is formed." In response, Applicant has cancelled Claim 8, and submitted new claim 9 which has been drafted to overcome the objections of the Examiner. New Claim 9 states in part that the inner surface includes a coupling thread engageable with a corresponding coupling thread of the container mouth. Therefore, reconsideration and withdrawal of this objection is requested.

In paragraph 3 of the Office Action, Claim 8 was rejected as being unpatentable over Dixon (US 2005/0040052) (Dixon) in view of Alexander et al. (US 2003/0172949) (Alexander).

Reconsideration is requested.

The Examiner has urged that Dixon discloses a closure element comprising a closure body defining a plug portion that can be applied in a closure relationship to a mouth of a container which has a central recessed portion providing an auxiliary container (2) where the closure body defines a mantle portion (1) having an inner surface on which is formed a coupling thread for coupling to a corresponding coupling thread of the container mouth. In addition, it was stated that the closure element further comprised an integral closure cover having an inner surface coupled to the body by an integral foot element operating as a hinge.

The Examiner acknowledged that Dixon did not disclose that the recessed portion is delimited at a

4

Serial No.: 10/550,904

Examiner: Hylton, Robin Annette

top portion by a thickened circular rim which can be snap engaged in a circular slot that is delimited, at a top thereof, by a thickened circular rim, which can be snap engaged in a circular slot defined in said inner surface of said closure cover by an inner circular wall rim of said closure cover and a further inner circular rim of said inner surface of said closure cover.

Alexander was applied, by the Examiner, as teaching a closing arrangement wherein the body has a recessed portion delimited, at a top thereof, by a thickened circular rim, which can be snap engaged in a circular slot defined in the inner surface of the closure cover by an inner circular wall rim of said closure cover and a further inner circular rim of the inner surface of the closure cover.

Actually, Alexander discloses a container 10 including a cover 12 coupled to a platform or base 14 by a hinge assembly 13. The container 10 is configured so that the cover 12 includes a cavity 30 and the base 14 includes a cavity 32. Cavity 30 and other features of the cover 12 are provided with a first sealing interface, while also providing a place for a display or mirror 96. Cavity 32 of the base 14, with other features disclosed in this prior document, provide a second sealing interface, while also providing a place for storing and retaining cosmetic material.

The cover piece 24 is also defined by a peripheral edge 33. A groove 48 is circumferentially defined between the peripheral edge 33 of the cover piece 24 and a shorter peripheral wall 44. The groove 48 is configured to receive a peripheral rim 36 and a lip 38 when the container 10 is in a closed position. The groove 48 of the cover piece 24 thus provides a

5

Serial No.: 10/550,904

Examiner: Hylton, Robin Annette

first sealing interface and cavity 32, along with peripheral rim 36 and lip 38, of the base piece 26 provide a second sealing interface which, when engaged, provide a substantially hermetic or airtight seal.

Thus, Alexander discloses a very complex sealing construction which is very different from that pointed out in new claim 9 and which prior sealing construction has been specifically designed for fitting to a cover and a base including therein a respective cover cavity and a respective base cavity.

It would not be possible to tightly connect the cover and base disclosed in Alexander by merely forming a slot on the inner surface of the cover and an enlarged and thickened rim on the base.

In particular, Alexander fails to disclose any recessed portion delimited, at the top thereof by a thickened circular rim which can be snap engaged in a circular slot defined in the inner surface of the closure cover by an inner circular wall rim of the closure cover and a further inner circular rim of the inner surface of the closure cover. On the contrary, because of the two cavities (one in the cover and another in the base) it is necessary to configure the sealing means as above discussed, by providing a groove 38 which is necessarily defined between a peripheral edge of the cover piece 24 and a shorter peripheral wall 44 thereof. Such a groove cannot be considered as corresponding to the simple slot formed in the inner surface of Applicant's cover.

Therefore, even if Alexander teaches a cover and base, tightly coupled by snap engaging means, they are configured in a very different manner from that pointed out in new claim 9 which provides a simple slot

6

Serial No.: 10/550,904

Examiner: Hylton, Robin Annette

in the inner surface of the cover and an enlarged or thickened rim portion on the base of the vessel.

For these reasons, it is requested that the rejection that was applied to canceled claim 8 not be applied to new claim 9.

An early and favorable decision is respectfully requested.

Respectfully submitted,



James V. Costigan
Reg. No. 25,669

HEDMAN & COSTIGAN, P.C.
1185 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
(212) 302-8989